

1 THOMAS M. RIORDAN (S.B. #176364)
2 ELIZABETH C. LEMOND (S.B. #216690)
3 O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP
4 610 Newport Center Drive, 17th Floor
Newport Beach, CA 92660-6429
Telephone: (949) 760-9600
Facsimile: (949) 823-6994

5 Attorneys for Defendant,
6 TOYOTA MOTOR SALES, U.S.A., INC.
7

8 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
9 **NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

10
11 MARK R. CIABATTARI, and all
12 other persons similarly situated,
13 Plaintiffs,

14 v.
15 TOYOTA MOTOR SALES, U.S.A.,
16 INC., a California corporation;
17 GOODYEAR DUNLOP TIRES
NORTH AMERICA, LTD., LLC, an
Ohio limited liability corporation;
and DOES 1-30,

18 Defendants.

Case No. C05-04289 SC
**STIPULATED PROTECTIVE
ORDER**

Dept: 1
Judge: Honorable Samuel Conti

20 Subject to the approval of this Court and the provisions of Rule 26 of the
21 Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, plaintiff Mark R. Ciabattari, defendant Toyota
22 Motor Sales, U.S.A., Inc., and defendant Goodyear Dunlop Tires North America,
23 Ltd., LLC, (collectively, the "Parties") by and through their respective counsel of
24 record, hereby stipulate and agree that, with respect to any information, documents,
25 or things obtained by any Party to these actions during settlement negotiations or in
26 response to any discovery the following Stipulated Protective Order shall govern:

27 **1. PURPOSE AND LIMITATIONS**

28 The purpose of this Stipulated Protective Order is to allow the Parties

1 to have reasonable access to sensitive commercial, financial, and confidential
2 information from other Parties while protecting the confidentiality or privacy of that
3 information. The Parties acknowledge that this Stipulated Protective Order does
4 not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that
5 the protection it affords to Discovery Materials (defined below) extends only to the
6 limited information or items that are entitled under the applicable legal principles to
7 treatment as confidential. The Parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section
8 10, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order creates no entitlement to file
9 confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures
10 that must be followed and reflects the standards that will be applied when a Party
11 seeks permission from the Court to file material under seal.

12 **2. DEFINITIONS**

13 2.1 Party/Parties. “Party” or “Parties” means Mark R. Ciabattari,
14 Toyota Motor Sales, U.S.A., Inc., and Goodyear Dunlop Tires North America, Ltd.,
15 LLC, including all of their officers, directors, employees, consultants, retained
16 experts, agents, and outside counsel (and their support staff). This definition may
17 be modified if and when a plaintiff’s class is certified by the Court, or upon the
18 agreement of the original parties to this Stipulated Protective Order.

19 2.2 Discovery Material. “Discovery Material” means any
20 information, document, or tangible thing, upon which any expression,
21 communication, or representation has been recorded by any means, or response to
22 any discovery request, including by way of example, document requests,
23 interrogatories, requests for admissions, notices of deposition, requests to inspect,
24 initial disclosures, subpoenas and any other similar materials, or portions thereof.

25 2.3 Settlement Materials: “Settlement Materials” means any
26 information, document or tangible thing provided to the Receiving Party for the
27 purposes of settlement negotiations.

1 2.4 Confidential Information. “Confidential Information” means
 2 any (1) Settlement Materials or (2) Discovery Materials Producing Party designates
 3 as sensitive or proprietary business or financial information, personal information,
 4 or information furnished to it in confidence by any third party, which information is
 5 not known to the general public.

6 2.5 Receiving Party. “Receiving Party” means a Party to the action
 7 or any third party who receives Discovery Material or Settlement Material from a
 8 Producing Party.

9 2.6 Producing Party. “Producing Party” means a Party to the action
 10 or any third party who produces or otherwise makes available Discovery Material
 11 or Settlement Material to a Receiving Party.

12 2.7 Designating Party. “Designating Party” means a Party to the
 13 action or any third party who provides Settlement Materials to one or more Parties
 14 or third parties or who produces Discovery Materials that it designates as
 15 “Confidential Information.”

16 2.8 Counsel. “Counsel” means counsel of record, an employee in-
 17 house counsel of a Party, and their secretarial and support personnel and other
 18 assistants to whom it is necessary to disclose Confidential Information for the
 19 purpose of this action.

20 2.9 Expert. “Expert” means a person with specialized knowledge or
 21 experience in a matter pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by one Party
 22 or its Counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this action and who
 23 for the purposes of any settlement discussions and review of Settlement Materials,
 24 is not or has not been employed by or been a consultant to in the last 7 years
 25 another Party or of a competitor of another Party and who, at the time of retention,
 26 is not anticipated to become an employee of another Party or a competitor of
 27 another Party. For purposes related to this litigation other than settlement, the
 28 Parties agree to meet and confer about issues related to a Party’s Expert’s past

1 employment or consultant work with another Party or a competitor of another
2 Party. If these issues cannot be resolved informally, either Party may
3 move the Court to resolve the dispute. Until such time as these issues are resolved,
4 the Parties agree not to disclose Confidential Information to an Expert who was a
5 former or is a current employee or consultant of another Party or a competitor of
6 another Party.

7 2.10 Trial Preparation Materials. “Trial Preparation Materials”
8 means documents and materials such as pleadings, court papers and briefs, exhibits,
9 depositions, interrogatories, and the like, and summaries thereof or notes pertaining
10 thereto.

11 2.11 Other Plaintiffs: “Other Plaintiffs” means the named plaintiffs,
12 and their heirs, successors, and assigns, and their attorneys in the following
13 lawsuits:

14 a. *Stanley Monk v. Toyota Motor Sales, U.S.A. Inc., et al.*
15 (05CV10562, USDC, So. Dist. N.Y.)

16 b. *Jess Collinson, Scott M. Pollack and Thomas Hunt v.*
17 *Toyota Motor Sales, U.S.A., Inc., et al.* (05CV05471, USDC, Dist. N.J.)

18 c. *Kyle Bressler v. Toyota Motor Sales, U.S.A., Inc. et al.*
19 (05CV544, USDC, Mid. Dist. FL.))

20 d. *Patricia and Michael Beaird v. Toyota Motor Sales,*
21 *U.S.A., Inc., et al.*, (05CH22370, Circuit Court of Cook County)

22 e. *Thomas F. Pear v. Toyota Motor Sales, U.S.A., Inc. et al.*,
23 (05CV01778, USDC, Dist. CT.)

24 **3. SCOPE**

25 The protection conferred by this Stipulated Protective Order covers not
26 only Confidential Information, but also any information copied or extracted
27 therefrom, as well as copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations thereof, plus
28

1 testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties or Counsel to or in Court or in
2 other settings that might reveal Confidential Information.

3 **4. DESIGNATION OF CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION**

4 **4.1 Designation in General.** Any Party or non-party may designate
5 as “CONFIDENTIAL,” by so marking any Discovery Material – and any copies,
6 abstracts, excerpts or analyses thereof – given, used, served or produced by the
7 Party or non-party in connection with this action, including without limitation in
8 response to formal discovery demands or subpoenas or in compliance with the
9 initial disclosure requirements prescribed by Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, Rule
10 26(a), that the Designating Party or non-party in good faith believes to contain,
11 reflect, regard, or disclose any confidential, non-public, or proprietary business or
12 financial information. Further, any Party or non-party may designate as
13 “SETTLEMENT/CONFIDENTIAL,” by so marking any Settlement Material – and
14 any copies, abstracts, excerpts or analyses thereof – given, used, served or produced
15 by the Party or non-party for the purposes of settlement negotiations. All materials
16 designated as “CONFIDENTIAL” or “SETTLEMENT/CONFIDENTIAL” shall be
17 referred to in this Stipulated Protective Order as Confidential Information.

18 **4.2 Inadvertent Failure to Designate.** A Party or non-party that
19 inadvertently fails to mark an item as Confidential Information at the time it is
20 given, used, served or produced may correct its failure in writing, accompanied by
21 substitute copies of each item, container or folder, appropriately marked as
22 Confidential Information. Failure to designate is not a waiver of the confidential
23 nature of the material.

24 **4.3 Settlement Negotiations.** All documents provided to any Party
25 in connection with any settlement negotiations, whether marked so or not, are
26 Confidential Information and all copies must be returned to the Designating Party
27 immediately upon request. The Receiving Party agrees not to challenge the
28 **confidential designation of any Settlement Materials. Further, the Parties agree that**

1 all discussions about and information exchanged in connection with settlement
2 negotiations shall be kept strictly confidential, including but not limited to the fact
3 that such settlement negotiations are about to or have occurred.

4 **5. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS**

5 **5.1 Meet and Confer**. Except as provided in 4.3, the acceptance by
6 a Receiving Party of Confidential Information shall not constitute an admission or
7 concession or permit an inference that the Confidential Information is, in fact,
8 confidential. Should a Receiving Party object in good faith to such designation,
9 that Party must notify the Designating Party or Parties in writing of such objection,
10 specifying the basis thereof. The Parties shall then negotiate in good faith to
11 attempt to resolve their dispute regarding the confidentiality of the subject
12 materials. In conferring, the Receiving Party must explain the basis for its belief
13 that the confidentiality designation was not proper and must give the Designating
14 Party an opportunity to review the designated material and to explain the basis for
15 the designation.

16 **5.2 Judicial Intervention**. Should such meet-and-confer efforts fail,
17 the Designating Party may then apply to the Court for a protective order covering
18 the designated information within twenty (20) days from the receipt of such written
19 notice from the Receiving Party. Or the Receiving Party may file and serve a
20 motion under Civil Local Rule 7 that identifies the challenged material and sets
21 forth in detail the basis for the challenge. Each such motion must be accompanied
22 by a competent declaration that affirms that the movant has complied with the meet
23 and confer requirements and that sets forth with specificity the justification for the
24 designation provided by the Designating Party. The Designating Party shall bear
25 the burden of establishing the confidentiality of any material (except for Settlement
26 Materials as provided *supra* ¶ 4.3 which is deemed confidential) designated as
27 Confidential Information. The information which is the subject of such dispute
28 shall continue to be treated as confidential subject to this Stipulated Protective

1 Order for a period of twenty (20) court days following written notice of objection
 2 unless a motion for a protective order is filed within that time, in which case the
 3 information shall be treated as confidential pending the outcome of such motion. In
 4 the absence of such a motion, the documents or information shall not be treated as
 5 confidential upon the expiration of twenty (20) court days after written notice of
 6 objection.

7 **6. USE OF CONFIDENTIAL MATERIAL**

8 6.1 General. No Confidential Information shall be made public by
 9 the Receiving Party or divulged to anyone other than as set forth herein. Absent a
 10 specific order by the Court or if the Designating Party otherwise agrees, once
 11 designated as Confidential Information, such materials and information shall be
 12 used by the Parties solely in connection with this litigation, and not for any other
 13 purpose, including any business, competitive, or governmental purpose or function.

14 6.2 Maintenance. Confidential Information shall be held in custody
 15 and confidence by Counsel of the Receiving Party. Confidential Information
 16 (except for Trial Preparation Material, but including Confidential Information that
 17 is attached to Trial Preparation Material as exhibits, appendices, and the like) shall
 18 be maintained by each person Receiving it, when not in actual use, in a secure
 19 location inaccessible to any person not authorized by this Stipulated Protective
 20 Order to use such Confidential Information.

21 6.3 Advice of Counsel. Nothing under this Stipulated Protective
 22 Order shall bar or otherwise restrict Counsel from rendering advice to a Party with
 23 respect to this action, and in the course thereof, relying in a general way upon
 24 examination of any Confidential Information. However, in rendering such advice
 25 and in otherwise communicating with a Party, such Counsel shall not disclose the
 26 contents of any Confidential Information contrary to the terms or intent of this
 27 Protective Order.

28 6.4 Right to Disclose. Nothing in this Stipulated Protective Order

1 shall preclude any person or entity from disclosing or using, in any manner or for
 2 any purpose, any information or document if that information or document is
 3 lawfully obtained from a third party under no obligations of confidentiality with
 4 respect thereto and having the right to disclose such information. Similarly, the
 5 terms of this Stipulated Protective Order shall in no way affect a Party's right to
 6 reveal or disclose to anyone any information designated by that Party itself as
 7 CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION. Nothing herein shall prohibit a Party from
 8 disclosing CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION to the person the document
 9 identifies as the author, addressee or recipient of such material.

10 **7. ACCESS TO CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION**

11 **7.1 Permissible Disclosures.** Confidential Information shall be
 12 treated by each Receiving Party as confidential unless and until the Court rules to
 13 the contrary or the Designating Party agrees otherwise. Unless and until the Court
 14 rules or the Designating Party otherwise agrees, and except as set forth in Paragraph
 15 7.2 herein, access to or disclosure of Confidential Information shall be limited to
 16 the following persons and the following persons are bound by the terms of this
 17 Stipulated Protective Order, subject to the qualification provisions of Paragraph 7.2
 18 herein:

19 a. The Court and those employed by the Court, in which event
 20 such information shall be filed under seal (and kept under seal until further
 21 order of the Court);

22 b. Each of the named Parties to the litigation who has, through that
 23 Party's respective Counsel, signed this Stipulated Protective Order (or who
 24 has accepted the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order by the Party's
 25 counsel's execution of Appendix A hereto), including any representative of
 26 the Party (officers, directors, partners, employees) assisting in the
 27 prosecution or the defense of the litigation, and such Party's counsel,
 28 including the clerical, secretarial, and paralegal staff employed by such

1 counsel;

2 c. Other Plaintiffs provided, however, that in all such cases, before
3 disclosure, the Other Plaintiffs' lawyers to whom disclosure is made must
4 signify assent to the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order, on behalf of
5 their clients as well as themselves, by executing the acknowledgement
6 attached as Appendix A hereto, indicating that he or she has read and
7 understands this Stipulated Protective Order and has agreed to be bound by
8 its terms.

9 d. Court reporters and employees of court reporters engaged by
10 counsel to record and transcribe testimony in this litigation, and translators
11 engaged for any purpose in the litigation;

12 e. Experts retained for the purpose of assisting counsel in the
13 litigation to the extent reasonably necessary for the litigation of this action;
14 provided, however, that in all such cases the person to whom disclosure is
15 made must signify assent to the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order by
16 executing the acknowledgement attached as Appendix A hereto, indicating
17 that he or she has read and understands this Stipulated Protective Order and
18 has agreed to be bound by its terms; and

19 f. Persons from whom testimony is taken or is to be taken in the
20 litigation, either in a deposition or at trial, provided that Confidential
21 Information may be disclosed to such persons only in the preparation for,
22 review of, or in the course of his or her testimony, and that such person shall
23 not retain such Confidential Information after his or her testimony is
24 concluded; provided, however, that in all such cases the person to whom
25 disclosure is made must signify assent to the terms of this Stipulated
26 Protective Order by executing the acknowledgement attached as Appendix A
27 hereto, indicating that he or she has read and understood this Stipulated
28 Protective Order and has agreed to be bound by its terms.

1 7.2 Other Persons. Counsel desiring to qualify a person or persons
 2 to receive Confidential Information under paragraph 7.1(c), (d), (e) or (f) shall first
 3 obtain from each such person a signed undertaking in the form of Appendix A
 4 hereto.

5 7.3 Additional Parties. In the event that additional persons become
 6 parties to this action, they shall not have access to Confidential Information
 7 produced by or obtained from any Party or nonparty until the newly joined party or
 8 his or her counsel executes the acknowledgment attached as Appendix A hereto,
 9 indicating to all other Parties that he or she has read this Stipulated Protective Order
 10 and agrees to be bound by its terms.

11 7.4 Disclosure Pursuant to Subpoena. Should any non-party serve a
 12 subpoena calling for the production of any Confidential Information on any Party or
 13 Counsel for a Party who has received such information, the subpoenaed Party in
 14 such instance shall provide notice in writing via facsimile to the Designating Party
 15 immediately and in no event more than three days after Receiving the subpoena.
 16 Such notification must include a copy of the subpoena. It shall be the obligation of
 17 the Designating Party, prior to the response date on the subpoena, to seek a
 18 protective order or any other appropriate relief from the Court if the Designating
 19 Party wishes to maintain the confidentiality of the material. A Designating Party
 20 that fails to seek judicial relief to preclude the disclosure of any Confidential
 21 Information in response to a subpoena shall be deemed to have waived any claim of
 22 confidentiality with respect to such material.

23 7.5 Objection to Disclosure to Other Persons. Should any Party
 24 seek to disclose Confidential Information to such other persons not authorized to
 25 receive Confidential Information pursuant to paragraph 7(a-f), said Party shall
 26 identify in a written notice to the Designating Party (1) the specific Confidential
 27 Information; (2) the purpose of such disclosure; (3) the person(s) to receive the
 28 Confidential Information, by name, address and telephone number; (4) counsel for

1 that person(s), by name address and telephone number; and (4) any litigation,
2 administrative proceeding or proceeding, by caption and docket number. This
3 written notice will be provided at least sixty (60) days in advance of the intended
4 date of disclosure. The Designating Party in such instance shall provide any
5 objection to such disclosure in written notice to the other Party within thirty (30)
6 days after receipt of that Party's intent to disclose. No Confidential Information
7 shall be disclosed to that person(s) until the validity of the objection has been
8 resolved, either by an agreement between the Parties or by order of the Court. If no
9 objection is made by the Designating Party, then the identified Confidential
10 Information may be divulged by the Receiving Party to the identified person upon
11 his or her execution of the acknowledgement attached as Appendix A hereto,
12 indicating that he or she has read and understood this Stipulated Protective Order
13 and has agreed to be bound by its terms.

14 **8. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT OF PROTECTIVE ORDER**

15 Before obtaining access to any CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION
16 covered by this Stipulated Protective Order, each person (other than Counsel) who
17 is permitted to have access to CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION under this
18 Stipulated Protective Order must signify assent to the terms of this Stipulated
19 Protective Order by executing the acknowledgement attached as Appendix A
20 hereto, indicating that he or she has read and understands this Protective Order and
21 agrees to be bound by its terms. If a deponent or the attorney for a deponent refuses
22 to execute the acknowledgement attached as Appendix A hereto, he or she shall be
23 requested on the deposition record to agree to the terms of this Stipulated Protective
24 Order. Every deposition witness whose appearance at deposition is obtained
25 pursuant to the process of this Court and to whom CONFIDENTIAL
26 INFORMATION is disclosed at deposition is hereby ordered (1) to maintain all
27 CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION in confidence, and (2) not to disclose
28 CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION to anyone other than in accordance with the

1 terms of this Stipulated Protective Order.

2 **9. HANDLING OF CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION**

3 9.1 Deposition Transcripts. In the case of depositions and pretrial
4 proceedings, the Parties agree to provisionally treat the entire transcript of the
5 deposition or pretrial proceeding as Confidential Information. Within thirty (30)
6 days of receipt of the transcript, any Counsel may designate portions of the
7 transcript as Confidential Information by informing the reporter and other Counsel
8 in writing of such designations by page and line number. The reporter, who shall
9 first have agreed to abide by the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order, shall be
10 instructed to seal the transcript and include on the cover page the legend: "This
11 transcript portion contains information subject to a Protective Order and shall be
12 used only in accordance therewith."

13 9.2 Exclusion of Unauthorized Persons. When testimony
14 designated as Confidential Information is (or is sought to be) elicited during a
15 deposition or pretrial proceeding, persons not entitled to receive such information
16 under the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order shall be excluded from
17 attendance at the deposition or pretrial proceeding of this action during such time as
18 the Confidential Information is being disclosed, unless the Parties otherwise agree
19 or the Court otherwise orders.

20 9.3 Inadvertent Production. If during document production, the
21 Producing Party inadvertently produces a document entitled to protection under the
22 attorney-client privilege, the attorney work product doctrine, or other provisions of
23 applicable law: (a) the Parties agree that the erroneous or inadvertent production
24 shall not constitute a waiver of such protection as to either the subject matter of the
25 material or as to related documents or communications; and (b) the Producing Party
26 may request the return of the inadvertently produced document at any time before
27 the commencement of trial, but no more than thirty (30) days after the document is
28 first marked as a deposition exhibit, identified as a potential trial exhibit, or

1 otherwise identified by any Party in any pleading or correspondence served on all
2 Parties to this action. Any such request shall be made in writing, and shall identify
3 the basis for the claimed protection. If the Party (or Parties) that received the
4 inadvertently produced document agrees that the document is entitled to protection
5 (without regard to its inadvertent production), all copies of the inadvertently
6 produced document shall be returned to the producing Party or destroyed, and no
7 reference to such document shall be made in discovery, at trial, or any other
8 manner. If the Parties do not agree that the document is entitled to protection, the
9 burden is on the producing Party to file an appropriate motion with the Court within
10 forty-five (45) days after the document is first marked as a deposition exhibit,
11 identified as a potential trial exhibit, or otherwise identified by any Party in any
12 pleading or correspondence served on all Parties to this action. Further, the Parties
13 agree that *in camera* review of such documents or testimony is not a waiver of
14 privilege.

15 9.4 Unauthorized Disclosure. If a Receiving Party learns that, by
16 inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Confidential Information to any persons
17 or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order, the
18 Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the
19 unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all copies of the
20 Confidential Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized
21 disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or
22 persons to execute the acknowledgment attached as Appendix A hereto.

23 **10. FILING CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION**

24 Without written permission from the Designating Party or a court
25 order secured after appropriate notice to all interested persons, a Party may not file
26 in the public record in this action any Confidential Information. A Party that seeks
27 to file under seal any Confidential Information must comply with Civil Local Rule
28 79-5.

1 **11. FINAL DISPOSITION**

2 11.1 Termination of Participation in Action. Once participation in
 3 this action by any person obtaining Confidential Information has been terminated or
 4 otherwise concluded, all Confidential Information in the possession of such person
 5 shall be returned by such person within thirty (30) calendar days to the Counsel
 6 from whom he or she obtained such Confidential Information.

7 11.2 Termination of Action. Within sixty (60) days after the final
 8 termination of this action, counsel for the Receiving Party shall return all copies of
 9 the Confidential Information to counsel for the Designating Party, or shall, at the
 10 option of the Designating Party, destroy such Confidential Information, and certify
 11 in writing that said destruction has occurred to counsel for the Designating Party.

12 **12. RIGHT TO FURTHER RELIEF - NO WAIVER**

13 12.1 Right to Further Relief. This Stipulated Protective Order shall
 14 not prevent a Party from applying to the Court for relief from this Order or any of
 15 its terms or provisions, or from applying to the Court for further or additional
 16 protective orders.

17 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. Nothing in this Stipulated
 18 Protective Order shall be construed as a waiver of the right of any Party to object to
 19 the taking or admissibility of any testimony, the production of documents or
 20 tangible things, or the admissibility of other evidence where such an objection is
 21 based on a ground or grounds other than that the testimony or evidence involves
 22 CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION.

23 12.3 No Waiver Due to Review. Review of Confidential Information
 24 by Counsel or Experts shall not waive the confidentiality of the documents or
 25 objections to production.

26 **13. EFFECTIVE PERIOD**

27 The terms of this Stipulated Protective Order shall be effective and
 28 binding upon a Party upon the signature of its Counsel below. The restrictions on

1 use of Confidential Information set forth in this Stipulated Protective Order shall
2 survive the conclusion of this litigation and, after conclusion of this litigation, the
3 Court shall exercise limited jurisdiction for the purpose of enforcing this Stipulated
4 Protective Order.

5 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

6
7 Dated: March 1, 2006

8 /s/

9
10 Thomas M. Riordan
11
12 Attorneys for Defendant
13
14 TOYOTA MOTOR SALES, U.S.A.,
15 INC.

16 Dated: February 28, 2006

17 /s/

18
19 Mark F. Anderson
20 Attorneys for Plaintiff
21 MARK R. CIABATTARI

22 Dated: February 23, 2006

23 /s/

24
25 Ralph W. Robinson
26 Attorneys for Defendant
27 GOODYEAR DUNLOP TIRES
28 NORTH AMERICA, LTD., LLC,

29 PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.

30 Dated: 3/6, 2006

31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65
66
67
68
69
70
71
72
73
74
75
76
77
78
79
80
81
82
83
84
85
86
87
88
89
90
91
92
93
94
95
96
97
98
99
100
101
102
103
104
105
106
107
108
109
110
111
112
113
114
115
116
117
118
119
120
121
122
123
124
125
126
127
128
129
130
131
132
133
134
135
136
137
138
139
140
141
142
143
144
145
146
147
148
149
150
151
152
153
154
155
156
157
158
159
160
161
162
163
164
165
166
167
168
169
170
171
172
173
174
175
176
177
178
179
180
181
182
183
184
185
186
187
188
189
190
191
192
193
194
195
196
197
198
199
200
201
202
203
204
205
206
207
208
209
210
211
212
213
214
215
216
217
218
219
220
221
222
223
224
225
226
227
228
229
230
231
232
233
234
235
236
237
238
239
240
241
242
243
244
245
246
247
248
249
250
251
252
253
254
255
256
257
258
259
260
261
262
263
264
265
266
267
268
269
270
271
272
273
274
275
276
277
278
279
280
281
282
283
284
285
286
287
288
289
290
291
292
293
294
295
296
297
298
299
300
301
302
303
304
305
306
307
308
309
310
311
312
313
314
315
316
317
318
319
320
321
322
323
324
325
326
327
328
329
330
331
332
333
334
335
336
337
338
339
340
341
342
343
344
345
346
347
348
349
350
351
352
353
354
355
356
357
358
359
360
361
362
363
364
365
366
367
368
369
370
371
372
373
374
375
376
377
378
379
380
381
382
383
384
385
386
387
388
389
390
391
392
393
394
395
396
397
398
399
400
401
402
403
404
405
406
407
408
409
410
411
412
413
414
415
416
417
418
419
420
421
422
423
424
425
426
427
428
429
430
431
432
433
434
435
436
437
438
439
440
441
442
443
444
445
446
447
448
449
450
451
452
453
454
455
456
457
458
459
460
461
462
463
464
465
466
467
468
469
470
471
472
473
474
475
476
477
478
479
480
481
482
483
484
485
486
487
488
489
490
491
492
493
494
495
496
497
498
499
500
501
502
503
504
505
506
507
508
509
510
511
512
513
514
515
516
517
518
519
520
521
522
523
524
525
526
527
528
529
530
531
532
533
534
535
536
537
538
539
540
541
542
543
544
545
546
547
548
549
550
551
552
553
554
555
556
557
558
559
550
551
552
553
554
555
556
557
558
559
560
561
562
563
564
565
566
567
568
569
560
561
562
563
564
565
566
567
568
569
570
571
572
573
574
575
576
577
578
579
580
581
582
583
584
585
586
587
588
589
580
581
582
583
584
585
586
587
588
589
590
591
592
593
594
595
596
597
598
599
590
591
592
593
594
595
596
597
598
599
600
601
602
603
604
605
606
607
608
609
600
601
602
603
604
605
606
607
608
609
610
611
612
613
614
615
616
617
618
619
610
611
612
613
614
615
616
617
618
619
620
621
622
623
624
625
626
627
628
629
620
621
622
623
624
625
626
627
628
629
630
631
632
633
634
635
636
637
638
639
630
631
632
633
634
635
636
637
638
639
640
641
642
643
644
645
646
647
648
649
640
641
642
643
644
645
646
647
648
649
650
651
652
653
654
655
656
657
658
659
650
651
652
653
654
655
656
657
658
659
660
661
662
663
664
665
666
667
668
669
660
661
662
663
664
665
666
667
668
669
670
671
672
673
674
675
676
677
678
679
670
671
672
673
674
675
676
677
678
679
680
681
682
683
684
685
686
687
688
689
680
681
682
683
684
685
686
687
688
689
690
691
692
693
694
695
696
697
698
699
690
691
692
693
694
695
696
697
698
699
700
701
702
703
704
705
706
707
708
709
700
701
702
703
704
705
706
707
708
709
710
711
712
713
714
715
716
717
718
719
710
711
712
713
714
715
716
717
718
719
720
721
722
723
724
725
726
727
728
729
720
721
722
723
724
725
726
727
728
729
730
731
732
733
734
735
736
737
738
739
730
731
732
733
734
735
736
737
738
739
740
741
742
743
744
745
746
747
748
749
740
741
742
743
744
745
746
747
748
749
750
751
752
753
754
755
756
757
758
759
750
751
752
753
754
755
756
757
758
759
760
761
762
763
764
765
766
767
768
769
760
761
762
763
764
765
766
767
768
769
770
771
772
773
774
775
776
777
778
779
770
771
772
773
774
775
776
777
778
779
780
781
782
783
784
785
786
787
788
789
780
781
782
783
784
785
786
787
788
789
790
791
792
793
794
795
796
797
798
799
790
791
792
793
794
795
796
797
798
799
800
801
802
803
804
805
806
807
808
809
800
801
802
803
804
805
806
807
808
809
810
811
812
813
814
815
816
817
818
819
810
811
812
813
814
815
816
817
818
819
820
821
822
823
824
825
826
827
828
829
820
821
822
823
824
825
826
827
828
829
830
831
832
833
834
835
836
837
838
839
830
831
832
833
834
835
836
837
838
839
840
841
842
843
844
845
846
847
848
849
840
841
842
843
844
845
846
847
848
849
850
851
852
853
854
855
856
857
858
859
850
851
852
853
854
855
856
857
858
859
860
861
862
863
864
865
866
867
868
869
860
861
862
863
864
865
866
867
868
869
870
871
872
873
874
875
876
877
878
879
870
871
872
873
874
875
876
877
878
879
880
881
882
883
884
885
886
887
888
889
880
881
882
883
884
885
886
887
888
889
890
891
892
893
894
895
896
897
898
899
890
891
892
893
894
895
896
897
898
899
900
901
902
903
904
905
906
907
908
909
900
901
902
903
904
905
906
907
908
909
910
911
912
913
914
915
916
917
918
919
910
911
912
913
914
915
916
917
918
919
920
921
922
923
924
925
926
927
928
929
920
921
922
923
924
925
926
927
928
929
930
931
932
933
934
935
936
937
938
939
930
931
932
933
934
935
936
937
938
939
940
941
942
943
944
945
946
947
948
949
940
941
942
943
944
945
946
947
948
949
950
951
952
953
954
955
956
957
958
959
950
951
952
953
954
955
956
957
958
959
960
961
962
963
964
965
966
967
968
969
960
961
962
963
964
965
966
967
968
969
970
971
972
973
974
975
976
977
978
979
970
971
972
973
974
975
976
977
978
979
980
981
982
983
984
985
986
987
988
989
980
981
982
983
984
985
986
987
988
989
990
991
992
993
994
995
996
997
998
999
990
991
992
993
994
995
996
997
998
999
1000
1001
1002
1003
1004
1005
1006
1007
1008
1009
1000
1001
1002
1003
1004
1005
1006
1007
1008
1009
1010
1011
1012
1013
1014
1015
1016
1017
1018
1019
1010
1011
1012
1013
1014
1015
1016
1017
1018
1019
1020
1021
1022
1023
1024
1025
1026
1027
1028
1029
1020
1021
1022
1023
1024
1025
1026
1027
1028
1029
1030
1031
1032
1033
1034
1035
1036
1037
1038
1039
1030
1031
1032
1033
1034
1035
1036
1037
1038
1039
1040
1041
1042
1043
1044
1045
1046
1047
1048
1049
1040
1041
1042
1043
1044
1045
1046
1047
1048
1049
1050
1051
1052
1053
1054
1055
1056
1057
1058
1059
1050
1051
1052
1053
1054
1055
1056
1057
1058
1059
1060
1061
1062
1063
1064
1065
1066
1067
1068
1069
1060
1061
1062
1063
1064
1065
1066
1067
1068
1069
1070
1071
1072
1073
1074
1075
1076
1077
1078
1079
1070
1071
1072
1073
1074
1075
1076
1077
1078
1079
1080
1081
1082
1083
1084
1085
1086
1087
1088
1089
1080
1081
1082
1083
1084
1085
1086
1087
1088
1089
1090
1091
1092
1093
1094
1095
1096
1097
1098
1099
1090
1091
1092
1093
1094
1095
1096
1097
1098
1099
1100
1101
1102
1103
1104
1105
1106
1107
1108
1109
1100
1101
1102
1103
1104
1105
1106
1107
1108
1109
1110
1111
1112
1113
1114
1115
1116
1117
1118
1119
1110
1111
1112
1113
1114
1115
1116
1117
1118
1119
1120
1121
1122
1123
1124
1125
1126
1127
1128
1129
1120
1121
1122
1123
1124
1125
1126
1127
1128
1129
1130
1131
1132
1133
1134
1135
1136
1137
1138
1139
1130
1131
1132
1133
1134
1135
1136
1137
1138
1139
1140
1141
1142
1143
1144
1145
1146
1147
1148
1149
1140
1141
1142
1143
1144
1145
1146
1147
1148
1149
1150
1151
1152
1153
1154
1155
1156
1157
1158
1159
1150
1151
1152
1153
1154
1155
1156
1157
1158
1159
1160
1161
1162
1163
1164
1165
1166
1167
1168
1169
1160
1161
1162
1163
1164
1165
1166
1167
1168
1169
1170
1171
1172
1173
1174
1175
1176
1177
1178
1179
1170
1171
1172
1173
1174
1175
1176
1177
1178
1179
1180
1181
1182
1183
1184
1185
1186
1187
1188
1189
1180
1181
1182
1183
1184
1185
1186
1187
1188
1189
1190
1191
1192
1193
1194
1195
1196
1197
1198
1199
1190
1191
1192
1193
1194
1195
1196
1197
1198
1199
1200
1201
1202
1203
1204
1205
1206
1207
1208
1209
1200
1201
1202
1203
1204
1205
1206
1207
1208
1209
1210
1211
1212
1213
1214
1215
1216
1217
1218
1219
1210
1211
1212
1213
1214
1215
1216
1217
1218
1219
1220
1221
1222
1223
1224
1225
1226
1227
1228
1229
1220
1221
1222
1223
1224
1225
1226
1227
1228
1229
1230
1231
1232
1233
1234
1235
1236
1237
1238
1239
1230
1231
1232
1233
1234
1235
1236
1237
1238
1239
1240
1241
1242
1243
1244
1245
1246
1247
1248
1249
1240
1241
1242
1243
1244
1245
1246
1247
1248
1249
1250
1251
1252
1253
1254
1255
1256
1257
1258
1259
1250
1251
1252
1253
1254
1255
1256
1257
1258
1259
1260
1261
1262
1263
1264
1265
1266
1267
1268
1269
1260
1261
1262
1263
1264
1265
1266
1267
1268
1269
1270
1271
1272
1273
1274
1275
1276
1277
1278
1279
1270
1271
1272
1273
1274
1275
1276
1277
1278
1279
1280
1281
1282
1283
1284
1285
1286
1287
1288
1289
1280
1281
1282
1283
1284
1285
1286
1287
1288
1289
1290
1291
1292
1293
1294
1295
1296
1297
1298
1299
1290
1291
1292
1293
1294
1295
1296
1297
1298
1299
1300
1